



Appendix I

DATE: April 30, 2018
TO: Members of the Human Resources Committee of the Board
FROM: Alastair JS Summerlee
COPIES: Amanda Goth
Sandra Slater
RE: Succession Planning for Leaderships positions at Carleton University

Background: The Executive Committee of the Board requested that the interim President should develop and present a review of succession planning for leadership positions at Carleton University during his tenure 2017/18. As the plan contains information that may be personal, confidential and therefore sensitive, the Executive may decide whether the report should be presented to the Board or that only the high-level issues emerging from the analysis should be shared. The draft plan is attached to this memorandum for consideration and feedback.

Process to develop the draft Succession Plan: Individuals responsible for different units on campus were asked by the interim President to provide the following information:

- The name of the position and reporting relationship
- The name of the current incumbent
- Date of appointment
- Date of re-appointment/renewal or change (applies in most cases to academics seconded to administrative leadership positions or to contract appointments for staff)
- Whether or not an interim candidate is available internally in the event of a short-term (emergency) or longer-term replacement if needed
- The process for replacing the incumbent i.e., whether this would be an open, an internal or an external search and whether or not a search consultant would likely be used to facilitate the process
- Any particular issues or perceived current challenges/risks with the incumbent or replacing the incumbent

Different colours are used on the attached spread sheet.

The Faculties and the Library that report to the Provost and Vice-President (Academic) are given various colours to facilitate identifying direct administrative reports in each group.

Pink is used to indicate an area of concern or potential concern:

Red is used to indicate areas of serious concern.

General observations on support for succession planning at Carleton: In general, there is considerable University-wide effort to promote and support leadership training for both staff and faculty. This is embodied in a series of activities known as “*Carleton Leader*”. These have been developed by the Office of Quality Initiatives at Carleton specifically to train future leaders and to promote cross-university knowledge and training in leadership. It is also an important way for members of the community to understand how the University works. Not only is *Carleton Leader* renowned but it is currently being sought by other universities as a model for effective leadership development and was at the heart of the platinum (highest level) award for Healthy Workplace at the Canada Awards for Excellence held in Toronto fall 2017.

Carleton Leader comprises a series of three levels of intense interactions between and among participants with the opportunity to explore issues of leadership through theory, through the experiences of current leaders and to learn about different approaches and styles of leadership. *Carleton Leader* recognizes that leadership exists throughout the university; at all levels, in all areas. Leadership is about influence and impact. It is about individual self-awareness, engaging others in the pursuit of excellence and fostering a collective sense of Carleton University’s vision and mission while recognizing the diverse ways in which people may contribute to a positive future for the university. The core principle of the *Carleton Leader* philosophy is to cycle participants through a reflective learning process that moves from ME to WE to US such that we develop a community of leaders who think about the broader impact of their leadership. This impact can be seen to have benefits for the individual, benefits to the teams, departments, and groups we work within, and benefits to the university and beyond.

Participants are expected to engage in participatory leadership projects that are identified by the participants to improve life on campus. These projects are shared with current administrators and leaders and many of the ideas have been integrated into the strategic initiatives or actions on campus.

Carleton Leader Statistics 2013-2018 (Last Updated April 5, 2018)

To date there have been a total of **351** participants in *Carleton Leader*:

- 109 participants: Stream 1 “Exploring Leadership” (6 cohorts)
- 154 participants: Stream 2 “Developing Our Leadership Practice” (9 cohorts)
- 88 participants: Stream 3 “Strategic Leadership Across the University” (5 cohorts)
- 78 participants: currently in cohorts (as of spring 2018)
- 26 have missed a module or withdrew

Demographics

- 203 women and 148 men which represents 144 faculty and 207 staff have participated

Participants by Division

Participants have been spread across the major units and groups on campus with a reasonable percentage participation from each unit. The Director of Quality Initiatives, the Vice-President (Finance and Administration) and the President normally review the potential applicants to ensure an appropriate representation and balance in and among the various cohorts for *Carleton Leader*.

Unit/group	Number	Unit/group	Number
Academic administration	12	Library	16
Faculty of Engineering and Design	32	President’s Office	25
Finance and Administration	82	Research and International	9
Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences	47	Students and Enrolment	35
Graduate and Postdoctoral Studies	1	Faculty of Science	28
Faculty of Public Affairs	47	Sprott School of Business	17

Issues that emerge from the draft succession plan: In general, the efforts to train future leaders for both administrative (staff and faculty) leadership positions at Carleton are strong. During 2016/17, however, several

challenges became apparent. These included: (1) lack of forethought about staggering re-appointments of senior leaders so that there is continuous gradual turnover of leadership positions rather than several key positions falling vacant at the same time; (2) reliance on single-sourced consultants for external recruitment or belief that search processes can be conducted by internal teams (neither of these is appropriate in the current climate); (3) little active recruitment practised by Carleton; and (4) concerns about focus on leadership from the Indigenous community for Carleton.

In the past year, considerable effort has been expended to address these three challenges. By a combination of judicious planning for replacements and, frankly by serendipity, the key academic and leadership positions in the University (president, VPs and deans) are now staggered so that gradual turnover of University leadership can be expected for the next decade. The President designate will have an opportunity to choose a significant number of the senior management team of the institution over the next two years forming the basis of a strong team for the future in all areas.

The interim President conducted an open search for consultants to advise the University on search processes. Three Search Firms were identified as pre-qualified for use by the institution and all three of these firms have already been used or are being used in current searches.

The University, through the pre-qualified search consultants and through Universities Canada and the Council of Ontario Universities has begun a process to encourage more active recruitment for leadership positions particularly for the key academic and administrative positions in the University.

Carleton Leader will continue to play an important role in training potential internal candidates for staff and faculty administrative leadership positions on campus.

There is an absence of Indigenous leadership on campus especially within senior administrative/managerial positions. The senior management team have prioritized expansion of Indigenous presence on campus: a senior academic (likely to be awarded a CRC shortly) has been recruited to come to Carleton as a leader in the Indigenous studies program (her start date is set for July 1, 2018); Carleton has developed and funded, through an endowment for strategic initiatives, a program for pre-doctoral scholarships for Indigenous doctoral students. This will help grow strength among Indigenous scholars to compete for faculty positions in the future. The University has also sought participation from Algonquin elders in advising the president and University Management on indigeneity and Indigenous issues on campus. The University has taken steps to support retention of current Indigenous faculty although this is a constant struggle as the field is very competitive and individuals are constantly approached by other institutions. Finally, the University has implemented an affirmative employment program to recruit at least ten Indigenous faculty scholars to the University, and the interim President suggested that the President's Advisor on Indigenous Matters should be a member of the Indigenous community on campus. (The process to select such as an advisor needs to be managed carefully to ensure members of the community are involved in the selection process).

Since these initiatives were announced, issues of self-identification among Indigenous or potentially Indigenous faculty have emerged. This is a sensitive and challenging issue at several institutions across the country currently. It is suggested that further action on these issues should be delayed until the arrival of the senior Indigenous scholar (July 1, 2018) and the new President (July 1, 2018). Peter Dinsdale from the Board has also offered assistance in discussing and resolving the tensions and issues around self-identification of Indigenous peoples.

Current searches underway include:

- Search for the Associate Vice-President (Teaching and Learning) – *chaired by the interim provost*
- Search for the Director of Equity Services – *chaired by the interim president*
- Search for the Assistant Vice President (Facilities and Planning) – *chaired by the VP F&A*
- Search for the Chief Information Officer – *chaired by the VP F&A*

All four searches are being carried out with the assistance of external search consultants and the applicant pools are strong and deep. The searches will likely be completed successfully before the end of Summer 2018.

The President designate will be informed of the short lists for these searches and have the opportunity for input into the final decision in these searches.

In 2018/19, the following search processes will be initiated by members of the senior University executive (president and VPs):

- The Provost and Vice-President (for appointment summer 2019) – *process to be managed by the new president with an external search consultant*
- The deans of the Sprott School of Business and Engineering and Design (for appointment summer 2019) – *process to be managed by the interim provost with the help of a search consultant*
- The Dean of Graduate and Postdoctoral Affairs will be reviewed during the year – *process to be managed by the interim provost*

In addition, there will be a number of review processes and new appointments made by the VPs and Deans for associate/assistant VP positions and associate/assistant deans respectively. Most of these processes will be internal to the institution. In all cases, the President designate will have the opportunity to review the processes and prospective decisions.

Concerns that need to be addressed: Despite the successes in developing more effective succession planning processes, there are some concerns that have emerged. There are five areas of concern in the institution:

1. **Pension Plan Management:** in the medium-term there is a critical need to develop internal talent to support management of the Pension Plan at Carleton.
 2. **Advancement:** There are serious structural issues in Advancement. Despite the huge success of Advancement in the past year, this area of the University is in a critically sensitive position. Carleton undoubtedly has some of the best, externally recognized, personnel in Advancement (both Alumni Relations and Fund-raising). It is important to review the structure of this unit and the key positions in comparison with other universities.
 3. **Sprott School:** There are significant challenges in the Sprott School. The dean search in 2017/18 failed primarily because the University could not offer a competitive salary to individuals interested in the post. It will be a critical issue for the new dean to address middle management level strength as an early priority during her/his tenure.
 4. **Director of Communications:** The position and roles of communication and structure of the unit need to be reviewed in comparison with other institutions
 5. **Comparative salaries at the administrative/management level:** There are a number of positions where there are apparent inequities among salaries for similar positions in other institutions. This puts Carleton at risk of losing outstanding individuals who are being tempted away by offers from other institutions. It is **recommended** that, as a matter of priority, the department of Human Resources should develop a clear and consistent approach for the comparative study of salaries of administrative staff so appropriate comparisons can be made with similar positions in other universities. The university should then implement a process to adjust salaries where appropriate to unnecessary risk of losing excellent staff.
-