

Kin recognition by roots occurs in cycads and probably in conifers

Root Gorelick^{1,*} and Thomas E Marler²

¹Department of Biology; School of Mathematics & Statistics, and Institute of Interdisciplinary Studies; Carleton University; Ottawa, ON Canada;

²Western Pacific Tropical Research Center; University of Guam; UOG Station; Mangilao, Guam USA

Kin recognition by the roots of *Cycas edentata* was recently demonstrated. Our extensive literature search revealed this to be the first report of kin recognition in any spermatophyte other than angiosperms. Based on this new validation that the phenomenon occurs among phylogenetically diverse taxa, we conclude that kin recognition by roots may be an ancient phenomenon.

The ability to recognize whether neighbors are closely related or not has been shown for individual cycad plants.¹ A split-root design (“fence-sitter” design²) was used, with *Cycas edentata* seedlings serving as the focal plant. A half-sibling was grown in one pot and plants exhibiting varying degrees of relatedness were grown in the other pot. Within the context of the study, root contact with close relatives minimized root proliferation and whole plant growth, but root contact with non-relatives maximized root proliferation and whole plant growth. Phylogenetic implications were not discussed.

This is the first demonstration of kin recognition – via split root or any other design – in any plant species other than angiosperms. While hardly extensive, there have been diverse reports of kin recognition in flowering plants.^{3–8} A recent review⁹ lists six genera with kin/non-kin recognition and 12 genera with self/non-self recognition. All 18 genera were either eudicots or monocots and included the quintessential model organism *Arabidopsis thaliana*.^{10,11} Detection of kin recognition systems included split-root designs (both owner and sharer scenarios),^{2,9,12–14} ramet-pair

designs including some pots with kin and other pots with non-kin,⁵ introduction of root exudates,^{10,15} and introduction of volatiles.¹⁶

Surprisingly we could find no explicit mention of kin-recognition or self-recognition in gymnosperms, including in conifers. Extensive root grafting has been documented for conifers,^{17,18} but no effort was invested to determine if root grafting was due to random contact of roots rather than proximate roots somehow being attracted to one another. Root grafting is more extensive in natural stands (which presumably are outbred) than in cultivated stands (which presumably are inbred), while root grafting suppresses outward growth of roots.¹⁸ These observations imply that conifer root grafting is more common in strangers than in relatives, which is consistent with kin recognition and kin selection in conifers.

The recent validation of kin recognition in *Cycas edentata*¹ is interesting if one follows Peter Crane’s tree of life phylogenetic tree (<http://tolweb.org/Spermatopsida/20622>), with one massive polytomy for all extant seed plants and many extinct ones. While seed plant phylogenetic trees seem to be eternally in flux,^{19,20} there are reasons to question Crane’s tree, such as the hypothesis that Gnetales are aberrant conifers.²¹ Cycads and ginkgos are unique among extant seed plants in having enormous sperm cells with flagella; sperm cells that eventually grow much larger than the pollen/prepollen grain that carried them to the female cone (zoidigamy).^{22,23} All other extant

Keywords: altruism, ancient traits, Cycadaceae, Cycadales, kin recognition

*Correspondence to: Root Gorelick;
Email: Root.Gorelick@carleton.ca

Submitted: 01/07/2014

Revised: 01/26/2014

Accepted: 01/27/2014

Published Online: 02/06/2014

Citation: Gorelick R, Marler TE. Kin recognition by roots occurs in cycads and probably in conifers. Communicative & Integrative Biology 2014; 7:e28009; <http://dx.doi.org/10.4161/cib.28009>

Addendum to: Marler TE. Kin recognition alters root and whole plant growth of split-root *Cycas edentata* seedlings. HortScience 2013; 48:1266–9

seed plants (angiosperms, conifers, Gnetales) have largely unbranched pollen tubes containing small sperm cells that lack flagella (siphonogamy). This dichotomy between zoidogamy and siphonogamy may help resolve the basal seed plant polytomy. However, *Cycas edentata* shows that both zoidigamous and siphonogamous plants can have roots that recognize kin.

Validation of kin recognition in *Cycas edentata*¹ may be even more interesting if cycads are sister to all other extant seed plants. Cycads may have descended from medullosan seed ferns.^{24,25} Cycads and

medullosans share the following highly unusual characters: (1) ovule with double vasculature that is radially arranged, with integument vasculature arising from a basal vascular disc,^{24,26} (2) pollen/prepollen with alveolate sexine (the outermost layer of the grain has compartments of irregular size and shape),^{27,28} (3) presence of secondary phloem fibers,^{24,29} and (4) the more common feature of anamocytic/haplocheilic stomata (guard cells and subsidiary cells in a single stoma developed from a single initial epidermal cell).^{30,31} Details about putative relationships between Cycadales and Medullosales

do not matter so much as does the hypothesis that kin recognition by roots may be an ancient phenomena, at least as demonstrated by the phylogenetically wide occurrence of this phenomenon from angiosperms to conifers to cycads.

Disclosure of Potential Conflicts of Interest

No potential conflicts of interest were disclosed.

Acknowledgments

Thanks to a pair of anonymous reviewers and to the Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council of Canada (NSERC) for a Discovery Grant to RG.

References

- Marler TE. Kin recognition alters root and whole plant growth of split-root *Cycas edentata* seedlings. *HortScience* 2013; 48:1266-9
- Gersani M, Abramsky Z, Falik O. Density-dependent habitat selection in plants. *Evol Ecol* 1998; 12:223-34; <http://dx.doi.org/10.1023/A:1006587813950>
- Donohue K. The influence of neighbor relatedness on multilevel selection in the Great Lakes sea rocket. *Am Nat* 2003; 162:77-92; PMID:12856238; <http://dx.doi.org/10.1086/375299>
- Callaway RM, Mahall BE. Plant ecology: family roots. *Nature* 2007; 448:145-7; PMID:17625553; <http://dx.doi.org/10.1038/448145a>
- Dudley SA, File AL. Kin recognition in an annual plant. *Biol Lett* 2007; 3:435-8; PMID:17567552; <http://dx.doi.org/10.1098/rsbl.2007.0232>
- Hess L, De Kroon H. Effects of rooting volume and nutrient availability as an alternative explanation for root self/non-self discrimination. *J Ecol* 2007; 95:241-51; <http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2745.2006.01204.x>
- Klemens JA. Kin recognition in plants? *Biol Lett* 2008; 4:67-8; PMID:18089522; <http://dx.doi.org/10.1098/rsbl.2007.0518>
- Bhatt MV, Khandelwal A, Dudley SA. Kin recognition, not competitive interactions, predicts root allocation in young *Cakile edentula* seedling pairs. *New Phytol* 2011; 189:1135-42; PMID:21118260; <http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1469-8137.2010.03548.x>
- Chen BJW, Daring HJ, Anten NPR. Detect thy neighbor: identity recognition at the root level in plants. *Plant Sci* 2012; 195:157-67; PMID:22921010; <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.plantsci.2012.07.006>
- Biedrzycki ML, Jilany TA, Dudley SA, Bais HP. Root exudates mediate kin recognition in plants. *Commun Integr Biol* 2010; 3:28-35; PMID:20539778; <http://dx.doi.org/10.4161/cib.3.1.10118>
- Caffaro MM, Vivanco JM, Botto J, Rubio G. Root architecture of *Arabidopsis* is affected by competition with neighbouring plants. *Plant Growth Regul* 2013; 70:141-7; <http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s10725-013-9786-7>
- Meier IC, Angert A, Falik O, Shelef O, Rachmilevitch S. Increased root oxygen uptake in pea plants responding to non-self neighbors. *Planta* 2013; 238:577-86; PMID:23779000; <http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s00425-013-1910-4>
- Gersani M, Brown JS, O'Brien EE, Maina GM, Abramsky Z. Tragedy of the commons as a result of root competition. *J Ecol* 2001; 89:660-9; <http://dx.doi.org/10.1046/j.0022-0477.2001.00609.x>
- Falik O, de Kroon H, Novoplansky A. Physiologically-mediated self/non-self root discrimination in *Trifolium repens* has mixed effects on plant performance. *Plant Signal Behav* 2006; 1:116-21; PMID:19521491; <http://dx.doi.org/10.4161/psb.1.3.2639>
- Fang S, Clark RT, Zheng Y, Iyer-Pascuzzi AS, Weitz JS, Kochian LV, Edelsbrunner H, Liao H, Benfey PN. Genotypic recognition and spatial responses by rice roots. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A* 2013; 110:2670-5; PMID:23362379; <http://dx.doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1222821110>
- Karban R, Shiojiri K. Self-recognition affects plant communication and defense. *Ecol Lett* 2009; 12:502-6; PMID:19392712; <http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1461-0248.2009.01313.x>
- Teste FP, Simard SW, Durall DM, Guy RD, Berch SM. Net carbon transfer between *Pseudotsuga menziesii* var. *glauca* seedlings in the field is influenced by soil disturbance. *J Ecol* 2010; 98:429-39; <http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2745.2009.01624.x>
- Tarroux E, Destrochers A. Effect of natural root grafting on growth response of jack pine (*Pinus banksiana*; Pinaceae). *Am J Bot* 2011; 98:967-74; PMID:21653509; <http://dx.doi.org/10.3732/ajb.1000261>
- Dominguez E, Wheeler QD. Taxonomic stability is ignorance. *Cladistics* 1997; 13:367-72
- Rydin C, Källersjö M, Friis EM. Seed plant relationships and the systematic position of Gnetales based on nuclear and chloroplast DNA: Conflicting data, rooting problems, and the monophyly of conifers. *Int J Plant Sci* 2002; 163:197-214; <http://dx.doi.org/10.1086/338321>
- Winter K-U, Becker A, Münster T, Kim JT, Saedler H, Theissen G. MADS-box genes reveal that gnetophytes are more closely related to conifers than to flowering plants. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A* 1999; 96:7342-7; PMID:10377416; <http://dx.doi.org/10.1073/pnas.96.13.7342>
- Poort RJ, Visscher H, Dilcher DL. Zoidogamy in fossil gymnosperms: The centenary of a concept, with special reference to prepollen of late Paleozoic conifers. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A* 1996; 93:11713-7; PMID:16594095; <http://dx.doi.org/10.1073/pnas.93.21.11713>
- Gorelick R. Cycad prepollen: description and possible evolutionary consequences of zoidogamy. *Cycad Newsltt* 2001; 24:12-24
- Norstog KJ, Nicholls TJ. The biology of cycads. Cornell University Press, Ithaca. 1997.
- Zhang W, Yang XJ, Fu XP, Zheng SL, Wang YD. A polyxylic cycad trunk from the Middle Jurassic of western Liaoning, China, and its evolutionary implications. *Rev Palaeobot Palynol* 2012; 183:50-60; <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.revpalbo.2012.07.005>
- Taylor TN. Paleozoic seed studies: on the structure of *Conostoma leptospermum* n. sp. and *Albertlongia incostata* n. gen. et sp. *Palaeontographica*. Abt B 1967; 121:23-9
- Taylor TN. The ultrastructure and reproductive significance of *Monoletes* (Pteridospermales) pollen. *Can J Bot - Rev Can Bot* 1978; 56:3105-18.
- Taylor TN. Pollen and pollen organ evolution in early seed plants. In: Niklas KJ, ed. *Paleobotany, paleoecology, and evolution* (volume 2), Praeger Publisher, New York. 1981:1-26.
- Smoot EL. Phloem anatomy of the Carboniferous pteridosperm *Medullosa* and evolutionary trends in gymnosperm phloem. *Bot Gaz* 1984; 145:550-64; <http://dx.doi.org/10.1086/337490>
- Thomas HH, Bancroft N. On the cuticles of some recent and fossil cycadean fronds. *Trans Linn Soc Bot* 1913; 8:155-204
- Reihman MA, Schabillon JT. Stomatal structure of *Alethopteris sullivantii* and *Neuropteris scheuchzeri*, Pennsylvanian pteridosperm foliage. *Am J Bot* 1985; 72:1392-6; <http://dx.doi.org/10.2307/2443511>